

## The Art and Science of Hybrid War

Dr Zia Ul Haque Shamsi

The concept of **hybrid war** is not new, rather its **tenets** اصولوں include all **shades** رنگ of **kinetic** and **non-kinetic warfare**. However, what is new is its scientific application artistically. The artistic mannerism انداز of hybrid war deals mainly with **intangible** جسے محسوس نہ کیا جاسکے elements: psycho-social, mind-making, negative **perception** تصور development and management. The primary objective of the executioner remains to create **uncertainty** غیر یقینی صورتحال and dissatisfaction about the future of the state among the majority of the population. Whereas, the scientific application of the elements of hybrid war deals with **tangible** ٹھوس impact on people through economic **coercion** دباؤ، جبر، cyber-crimes, physical impact, and even **territorial** علاقائی capture. Perhaps, this 'hybridity' makes hybrid warfare the favourite tool of application by all strategists and **practitioners** پیشہ ور لوگ. Moreover, the intangible applications are relatively less risky and do not lead to activation of any international law or **violation** ورزی of major **treaties** معاہدے or agreements, at least for now.

The **perpetrators** مجرموں of hybrid war aim to create a **synergetic** ہم آہنگی effect of their effort on the target state, utilising all available **avenues** راستے: tangible and intangible. Tangible elements of warfare which are far more scientific

now due to the tech **revolution** انقلاب in military warfare, and **sophistication** نفاست in weapon **inventories** فہرست, include physical impact through military hardware where the enemy is visible. However, the intangible elements of warfare which fall in the **domain** دائرہ of artistic applications, and where the enemy is invisible and operates from within, are far more damaging and effective. for instance, economic warfare may include disruption in stock exchanges and creating **volatility** اتار جان بوجھ in the currency market, both aimed at **purposely** جان بوجھ scaring investors away to weaken a state. According to Colin S Gray, since 'the character of warfare in a period is shaped, even driven, much more by the political, social, and strategic contexts than it is by changes **integral** لازمی to military science,' the perpetrators of hybrid war seek to alter the character of the target state for which they are willing to go to any length.

Though hybridity in threats against an **adversary** مخالفت is not a new strategy in **non-kinetic warfare**, it has certainly **paralysed** international law in its application to **avert** ہٹانا, the threat, particularly against relatively smaller and weaker states. Perhaps, this is one reason that Europe is faced with another war at the moment, which clearly reflects the **inability** of international laws to **avert** بچنے kinetic and non-kinetic threats of different nature and character. However, in Vladimir Baytuk's (2017) view, the most **probable** ممکنہ driver of the **emergence** ظہور of hybrid threats is grounded in the evolving nature of global order, of which the social, political and economic **components** اجزا have changed **dramatically** ڈرامائی

طور پر since the end of the **Cold War**. Perhaps, Andrew Mumford's **description** تفصیل of a hybrid **adversary** دشمنی is the most **comprehensive** وسیع. According to him, a hybrid adversary is 'one that uses a combination of political, military, economic, social and intelligence methods of influence, as well as **conventional** روایتی, irregular, terrorist and criminal methods of warfare.'

A **glimpse** جھلک of the artistic application of intangible elements of hybrid warfare was **witnessed** دیکھا گیا during 2005-20 by Pakistan at the hands of an **Indian-sponsored** بھارت **campaign** کے زیر اہتمام , as discovered by European watchdog **EU DisinfoLab**. Although Pakistan had been highlighting India's efforts to soften its inner ring at the international forums, these concerns were not given any **weightage** اہمیت until the 'Indian Chronicles' appeared.

On the other hand, the scientific application of kinetic elements is in full swing in Europe where an '**Iron Curtain**' is being drawn between Russia and Ukraine, as the war between the two neighbouring states is entering the sixth month. While **protracted** طویل wars are **counterproductive** بے نتیجہ, highly destructive, and expensive, the end of this war is not in sight.

Interestingly, the art of **executing** عمل کرنا hybrid war is to **evade** بچنے کے لیے international **obligations** ذمہ داریوں and help perpetrators **gainfully** نفع بخش طور پر employ the intangible elements of warfare. The purpose remains to weaken the target state from within and make people feel insecure, uncertain, and lose confidence in the government and its

institutions. Whereas, the scientific execution of hybrid war elements is aimed at the physical destruction of the target state through the strategic application of sophisticated weaponry and technological means.

The international system is fast **evolving** تيار ہونا with new political **alignments** صف بندی. While the United States wants to extend its superpower status through hard power, China is **striving** کوشش کر رہا to achieve the same through the elements of soft power. China is depending on the art of war, whereas the US is deploying scientific elements. The question remains as to where Europe and Russia stand at the moment? Perhaps, the answer would come when the iron curtain is finally drawn between Russia and Ukraine, unfortunate though that may be.

The writer is the author of the book 'Nuclear Deterrence and Conflict Management Between India and Pakistan'. He is presently working as the Director of the Centre for Aerospace and Security Studies (CASS

## Bilateral Trade Agreement دو طرفہ

Pakistan and Afghanistan have **penned** دستخط کیے an agreement to facilitate bilateral trade, especially when it comes to the use of coal in power generation to make up for the shortfall in electricity production in the **wake of** کے نتیجے میں the high cost of **furnace oil** بھٹی کا تیل in the international market. Coal was already being imported in small quantities for power generation via the Chaman border station in Balochistan. Under this new agreement, coal imports will start at custom stations in Kharlachi and Ghulam Khan in Khyber Pakhtunkhwa.

According to reports, the coal will be used for power production at two plants—Hubco and Sahiwal plants. This is a positive development as it will help Pakistan significantly with addressing its energy **woes** پریشانیاں as coal will be transported through trucks via land **routes** راستے. These decisions were reached during the three-day visit (July 18-20) of a Pakistan trade **delegation** وفد to Kabul where mutual actions for **enhancing** بڑھانا **bilateral** دو طرفہ trade, **transit** منتقلی, and connectivity were discussed. It is good to see mutually beneficial arrangements being agreed upon considering how Pakistan has already turned into a **net importer** from Afghanistan since the Taliban took control of Kabul in August 2021.

In return, Islamabad has offered a number of facilitation measures to promote **imports** درآمدات from Afghanistan. One of the major demands from Kabul was for duty-free (tax free) imports from Afghanistan, particularly of food items, to help

combat مہنگائی rising food inflation. During the meetings between the two sides, it was also agreed that border crossing points will be made more efficient، to ensure early clearance of trade and transit traffic and to address the bottlenecks and impediments on a priority basis. In addition to this, a Temporary Admission Document (TAD) will also be implemented which will allow free movement of bilateral trade vehicles and prevent the loading and unloading of goods at the border crossing points with the view to further increasing trade between the two countries.

This is a win-win arrangement for both sides given how the global economy has been suffering due to the impact of the Russia-Ukraine war. At this point, Afghanistan's coal trade market is one of its biggest revenue resources, which is running an economic cycle benefitting the common Afghans from miners to transporters. The coal export has helped the Afghan government to generate revenue, which is critical given the deep crisis the country finds itself in. This momentum must be sustained and should be further strengthened in a manner that is mutually beneficial for both the countries.

## Renegotiating The Iran Deal

The international community is about to learn the crucial lesson that as difficult it is to reach a deal, it is perhaps much more cumbersome to re-enter an agreement that was previously set aside on bad terms. After Joe Biden took on the US presidency in 2020, it was assumed that it would reverse what was perhaps one of the most damaging aspects of the Trump doctrine – the throwaway of the Iran nuclear deal.

However, the international community is learning that this is something not so easy to do, and certainly, the same circumstances and limits cannot be imposed again as the world is widely different now than it was at the time the deal was set in place. According to the International Atomic Energy Agency, Iran's nuclear programme is "galloping ahead", which might be a "fatal blow" to chances of reviving the deal following 2018's pull-out by the United States.

It speaks to the failures of the relevant security regimes that such damages had not been predicted. Firstly, it appears evident that with the lack of any incentives, Iran would continue with any nuclear programme, and perhaps more aggressively. There has been the arrival of a new government in Iran last year, which is markedly

پر different, with the new President Ebrahim Raisi being more **conservative** قدامت پسند and **hard-line** سخت than the previous Rouhani government.

Secondly, the world powers must also be **cognizant** آگاہ of the fact that what is happening on the diplomatic stage with other countries affects any **potential** ممکنہ transactions in the region.

**Escalations** اضافہ شدت میں of the European Union and the US with Russia are bound to have an impact on Iran's approach towards **reconciliation** مفاہمت over nuclear matters.

**Nevertheless** بحرحال, it is important that both sides come to the table and settle differences soon. A **conflict** تنازعہ in Iran would have a highly **destabilising** عدم استحکام کا effect on the rest of the region, and with the **chaos** افراتفری in Afghanistan, the world cannot afford such **uncertainty** غیر یقینی صورتحال.

Pakistan too should play a part to sit both sides down at the table. A **sanction less** پابندی کے بغیر Iran is important for Pakistan to **map out** دینا تشکیل a path for regional development, along with China.



**Hybrid warfare** is a theory of military strategy, first proposed by Frank Hoffman, which employs political warfare and blends conventional warfare, irregular warfare, and cyberwarfare with other influencing methods, such as fake news, diplomacy, lawfare and foreign electoral intervention.

**Kinetic military action** is a euphemism for military action involving active warfare, including lethal force. The phrase is used to contrast between conventional military force and "soft" force, including diplomacy, sanctions and cyber warfare

### **Non kinetic warfare**

Nation-state adversaries are leveraging non-kinetic warfare strategies that include disinformation campaigns, cyber attacks, and economic espionage against federal, state, and local governments to gain strategic and economic advantages over the United States

### **cold war**

noun

a state of political hostility between countries characterized by threats, propaganda, and other measures short of open warfare.

the state of hostility that existed between the Soviet bloc countries and the Western powers from 1945 to 1990.

**EU DisinfoLab** is a young independent NGO focused on researching and tackling sophisticated disinformation campaigns targeting the EU, its member states, core institutions, and core values.

### **Iron curtain**

a political, military, and ideological barrier that cuts off and isolates an area

A **net importer** is defined as a country that imports more than it exports. Imports are the goods and services brought into the country from a foreign country. Exports refer to the goods and services provided by a country to foreign clients. Imports and exports summed up constitute the total trade by a country

In a **win-win situation**, all parties benefit from the final agreement or contract. A negotiator **ثالث** using win-win tactics seeks to provide benefits to all parties involved in a negotiation. Collaboration is essential to a win-win strategy

### **Be on bad term**

To be in a state of utter disagreement, dislike, or contempt with someone

The **Iran nuclear agreement**, formally known as the Joint Comprehensive Plan of Action (JCPOA), is a landmark accord reached between Iran and several world powers, including the

United States, in July 2015. Under its terms, Iran agreed to dismantle much of its nuclear program and open its facilities to more extensive international inspections in exchange for billions of dollars' worth of sanctions relief.

Proponents of the deal said that it would help prevent a revival of Iran's nuclear weapons program and thereby reduce the prospects for conflict between Iran and its regional rivals, including Israel and Saudi Arabia. However, the deal has been in jeopardy since President Donald Trump withdrew the United States from it in 2018. In retaliation جوابی کارروائی for the U.S.

departure and for deadly attacks on prominent Iranians in 2020, including one by the United States, Iran has resumed some of its nuclear activities.

The **International Atomic Energy Agency** (IAEA) is an international organization that seeks to promote the peaceful use of nuclear energy, and to inhibit its use for any military purpose, including nuclear weapons. The IAEA was established as an autonomous organization on 29 July 1957. Though established independently of the United Nations through its own international treaty, the IAEA Statute, the IAEA reports to both the United Nations General Assembly and Security Council.